

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA
ATLANTA DIVISION**

IN RE: DELTA/AIRTRAN BAGGAGE
FEE ANTITRUST LITIGATION

CIVIL ACTION FILE NUMBER
1:09-md-2089-TCB

ALL CASES

**PLAINTIFFS' DAUBERT MOTION TO EXCLUDE THE OPINIONS
AND TESTIMONY OF DR. ERIC GAIER**

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 702 and *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*, 509 U.S. 579 (1993), Plaintiffs hereby file this *Daubert* Motion to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Eric Gaier. Because the Court does not need to rely on AirTran economist Dr. Gaier's testimony to resolve any class certification issues, it is unnecessary for the Court to consider this Motion prior to ruling on class certification. *Local 703 v. Regions Fin. Corp.*, 762 F.3d 1248, 1258 n.7 (11th Cir. 2014). However, at trial (and if deemed relevant, at class certification), the Court should exclude discrete areas of testimony offered by Dr. Gaier as irrelevant, unreliable and misleading.

First, Dr. Gaier offers opinions on purported base fare offsets that were purportedly caused by Defendants' imposition of first bag fees. But because base fare offsets are irrelevant as a matter of law and the amounts of the purported offsets are therefore not an issue, Dr. Gaier's testimony about offsets should be excluded

because it will not “help the trier of fact . . . to determine a fact in issue.” Fed. R. Evid. 702.

Second, Dr. Gaier performed a rough “difference-in-differences” calculation of the alleged decline in AirTran’s base fares after AirTran implemented its first bag fee. But Dr. Gaier’s difference-in-differences calculation lacks control variables, and contains a basic arithmetic error, and therefore yields unreliable and inaccurate results.

Finally, Dr. Gaier performed regression analyses of alleged base fare declines. But Dr. Gaier’s multiple regression analyses are also unreliable, as they lack critical control variables.

For the reasons set forth in Plaintiffs’ supporting memorandum, which Plaintiffs expressly incorporate herein, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court exclude Dr. Gaier’s opinions on base fare offsets, including: (1) his rough difference-in-differences calculation; and (2) his regression analysis.

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: October 23, 2015

/s/ Daniel L. Low

Daniel L. Low
Daniel A. Kotchen
KOTCHEN & LOW LLP
1745 Kalorama Rd., NW
Suite 101
Washington, DC 20009
dkotchen@kotchen.com

James L. Ward, Jr.
Robert S. Wood
RICHARDSON, PATRICK,
WESTBROOK & BRICKMAN, LLC
P.O. Box 1007
1037 Chuck Dawley Blvd., Bldg. A
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29465

dlow@kotchen.com

jward@rpwb.com
bwood@rpwb.com

R. Bryant McCulley
Stuart H. McCluer
McCULLEY MCCLUER PLLC
P.O. Box 505
Isle of Palms, SC 29451
bmcculley@mcculleymccluer.com
smccluer@mcculleymccluer.com

Cale H. Conley
Georgia Bar. #181080
CONLEY, GRIGGS & PARTIN LLP
1380 West Paces Ferry Road NW
#2100
Atlanta, GA 30327
cale@conleygriggs.com

*Interim Co-Lead Counsel for
Plaintiffs*

David H. Flint
Georgia Bar No. 264600
Andrew Lavoie
Georgia Bar No. 108814
SCHREEDER WHEELER &
FLINT, LLP
1100 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite
800
Atlanta, GA 30309-4516
dflint@swfllp.com
alavoie@swfllp.com

*Interim Liaison Counsel for
Plaintiffs*

CERTIFICATION UNDER L.R. 7.1D

Pursuant to Northern District of Georgia Civil Local Rule 7.1D, the undersigned counsel hereby certifies that the above and foregoing is a computer document prepared in Times New Roman (14 point) font in accordance with Civil Local Rule 5.1B.

So certified, this 23rd day of October, 2015.

/s/Daniel L. Low

Daniel L. Low

KOTCHEN & LOW LLP

1745 Kalorama Rd. NW, Suite 101

Washington, DC 20009

dlow@kotchen.com

Interim Co-Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned counsel certifies that on this day he caused the foregoing to be filed, under seal, with the Clerk of Court and caused the same to be delivered via e-mail to the following attorneys of record:

<i>Counsel for Delta Air Lines, Inc.</i> Randall Lee Allen Sam Rutherford Nowell Berreth ALSTON & BIRD 1201 West Peachtree Street One Atlantic Center Atlanta, GA 30309-3424 randall.allen@alston.com sam.rutherford@alston.com nberreth@alston.com James P. Denvir Scott Gant Michael Mitchell BOIES SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP 5301 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W., Suite 800 Washington, DC 20015 jdenvir@bsfllp.com sgant@bsfllp.com mmitchell@bsfllp.com	<i>Counsel for AirTran Airways, Inc.</i> Bert W. Rein WILEY REIN LLP 1776 K Street N.W. Washington, DC 20006 brein@wileyrein.com Alden L. Atkins Vincent van Panhuys VINSON & ELKINS L.L.P. 2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Suite 500 West Washington, DC 20037 aatkins@velaw.com vvanpanhuys@velaw.com Roger W. Fones Anand Viswanathan MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP 2000 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Suite 600 Washington, DC 20006 rfones@mofo.com aviswanathan@mofo.com Thomas W. Rhodes William Parker Sanders SMITH, GAMBRELL & RUSSELL, LLP Suite 3100, Promenade II 1230 Peachtree Street, N.E.
---	--

	Atlanta, GA 30309 trhodes@sgrlaw.com psanders@sgrlaw.com
--	--

So certified, this 23rd day of October, 2015.

/s/Daniel L. Low

Daniel L. Low

KOTCHEN & LOW LLP

1745 Kalorama Rd. NW, Suite 101

Washington, DC 20009

dlow@kotchen.com

Interim Co-Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs